The Models of the Illuminators in the Early Gothic Period

TERRIER ALIFERIS, Laurence

Reference


Available at: http://archive-ouverte.unige.ch/unige:93960

Disclaimer: layout of this document may differ from the published version.
The Use of Models in Medieval Book Painting

Edited by

Monika E. Müller

CAMBRIDGE SCHOLARS PUBLISHING
The Use of Models in Medieval Book Painting,
Edited by Monika E. Müller

This book first published 2014

Cambridge Scholars Publishing

12 Back Chapman Street, Newcastle upon Tyne, NE6 2XX, UK

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Copyright © 2014 by Monika E. Müller and contributors

All rights for this book reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the copyright owner.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Abbreviations ........................................................................................................... vii

Editor’s Preface ..................................................................................................................... ix

Introduction ............................................................................................................................. xi
Monika E. Müller

The Role of Prototypes and Models in the Transmission of Medieval Picture Cycles: The Case of the Beatus Manuscripts ............................................ 1
Peter K. Klein

The Models of the Illuminators in the Early Gothic Period......................... 29
Laurence Terrier Aliferis

Glass Painters and Manuscript Illuminators ......................................................... 57
Guido Siebert

A Model Community? An Investigation into the Use of Models in the Work of William de Brailes................................................................. 89
Cynthia Johnston

Changing Workshop Policies: Passion Cycles by the Masters of Zweder van Culemborg................................................................. 111
Miranda Bloem

Tradition and Innovation in the Work of Jean Colombe: The Usage of Models in Late 15th Century French Manuscript illumination .......... 137
Christine Seidel

Corporate Design Made in Ghent/Bruges? On the Extensive Reuse of Patterns in Late Medieval Flemish Illuminated Manuscripts .......... 167
Joris Corin Heyder

Contributors ........................................................................................................................... 203
THE MODELS OF THE ILLUMINATORS
IN THE EARLY GOTHIC PERIOD

LAURENCE TERRIER ALIFERIS

At the end of the twelfth century and beginning of the thirteenth century, art north of the Alps experienced a very particular stylistic phase, echoing antique art in its use of fluid drapery and elegantly posed figures. Antique models are certainly studied carefully from a stylistic point of view as well as in order to copy certain specific motifs. These complement Byzantine influences, which, in turn, are used to vary the compositions by introducing iconographic ideas as well as specific motifs. These Byzantine influences are used widely by the illuminators, more than by the goldsmiths and certainly the sculptors. The latter turns instead to the study of antique works. Research into any potential antique models used by the illuminators for stylistic purposes has not led me to discover any arguments in favour of this theory. I propose to examine the specific behaviour of the illuminators around 1200 in their choice of models in order to understand why.

During the decades around the year 1200, essentially between 1180 and 1230, art saw a profound change, which has been known for the past forty years as the 1200 style. Various models are put together in order to form a style that is clearly identifiable with characteristics that are very specific. The uniqueness of the 1200 style rests on a stylistic proximity with the works of Antiquity. The strong classicizing trends of certain works were identified from the mid-nineteenth century and research into the models used generated lively debate on the subject of establishing its

---

1 The term was particularly coined by the exhibition of the Metropolitan Museum in 1970 dedicated to the artistic production of these years: The Year 1200. A Centennial Exhibition at the Metropolitan Museum of Art. On the Style 1200 and its connections with Antiquity, see my work L’imitation de l’Antiquité dans l’art medieval.

2 Since the rediscovery of Nicholas of Verdun’s Klosterneuburg ambo, classicism has primarily expressed scenes evoking antique Greek art. Camesina and Arneth, Das Niello-Antipendium, 6; Schnaase, Geschichte der bildenden Künste, 621.
origin. This antique influence serves to elaborate a resolutely innovative style orientated towards a more convincing representation of the surrounding world and is combined with the use of Byzantine motifs. It is in the area around the Meuse, the river making up the western frontier of the Holy Roman Empire, that one finds the foundations of this artistic movement, which would spread rapidly over a vast part of northern Europe, northern France, present-day Belgium, the Rhine region and as far as England. The sculptors working on the construction sites of the major cathedrals around 1200 (Sens, Chartres, Paris, Reims and Strasbourg among others) were working in this new style, which German researchers called Muldenfaltenstil, with clear reference to the antique models, which they found close to where they were working.\(^3\) The impetus for this movement was given by the Meuse goldsmith Nicholas of Verdun who created an ambo commissioned by the prior Wernher for Klosterneuburg Abbey.\(^4\) Nicholas of Verdun uses the Symmachi and Nicomachi diptych, a Roman artwork of the fourth century preserved during the Middle Ages in the Montier-en-Der Abbey close to Verdun and Reims.\(^5\) He studies this work and recaptures the relationship between body and garment, the proportions, the fluidity and articulation of the folds in the materials, the elegance of the gestures and the contrapposto. He also used sarcophaguses (including the Sarcophagus of Jovinus seen at Reims during the Middle Ages\(^6\) and other scenes in bas-reliefs resembling those present on the sarcophaguses found in Saint-Médard d’Eyrans and conserved at the Louvre)\(^7\) and statuettes in the round (such as the one preserved in Agen\(^8\) and the one representing Mars from Reims).\(^9\) One can verify the use of an antique source on the ambo at Klosterneuburg and also in Nicholas of Verdun’s two other works, the reliquary of the Three Kings of the Cologne Cathedral and the Shrine of our Lady in the city of Tournai in Belgium.

---

\(^3\) See Terrier Aliferis, *L’imitation de l’Antiquité*.

\(^4\) Röhrig, *Der Verduner Altar* and Buschhausen, *Der Verduner Altar*.


\(^7\) Terrier Aliferis, *L’imitation de l’Antiquité*.

\(^8\) Ibid.

\(^9\) Vitali, “*Sicut explorator et spoliiorum cupidus*”. 
Byzantine art is another important source of inspiration for Nicholas of Verdun\textsuperscript{10} and allows him to vary the postures and compositions of the fifty-one scenes of his ambo considerably. For example, Samson bearing away the gates of Gaza on the \textit{ambo at Klosterneuburg} is derived from a Byzantine composition, as shown by a comparison with the henchman carrying a martyr in the \textit{Menologium of Basil II}, created in Constantinople in around 985 (Fig. 1–2).\textsuperscript{11} We shall see that an illuminator at Goslar uses the same model fifty years later (Fig. 3). The parallels with Byzantine art are as numerous as those with antique art in the \textit{ambo at Klosterneuburg} and serve to show how diverse the influences are in creating an innovative style.\textsuperscript{12}

\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{samson}
\caption{Nicholas of Verdun, altarpiece, Klosterneuburg Abbey, detail: Samson}
\end{figure}

\textsuperscript{10} Since the works of Kitzinger, “The Byzantine Contribution to Western Art of the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries”, 25-57.
\textsuperscript{11} The comparaison was discovered by Vitali, “\textit{Sicut explorator et spoliorum cupidus}”, 13-14. A facsimile of the Menologium was published recently, \textit{El «Menologio» de Basilio II, emperador de Bizancia}.
\textsuperscript{12} Buschhausen, “The Klosterneuburg Altar of Nicholas of Verdun: Art, Theology and Politics”; Idem, \textit{Der Verduner Altar}.
Fig. 2 Città del Vaticano, BAV, Vat. gr. 1613, fol. 280: Menologium of Basil II
Fig. 3 Goslar, City Library, fol. 45r (1230–1240): Gospels of Goslar
Nicholas of Verdun gives impetus to a close study of the works of Antiquity existing in Gaul and in Germania that serve to shape an art with varied motifs and one that represents the surrounding world as faithfully as possible. From the beginning of the 1180s, the sculptors of the cathedral of Sens adopt the same practice and turn towards the city’s relics. This case is extremely interesting as the sculpture of Sens from the end of the twelfth century bears similarities to classical Greek sculpture in the garments tightly hugging the body. The garments cling to the whole body and create folds rounded in sections. They recall works such as the Nike of Paionios at Olympia and a Roman tombstone at Sens reflects this stylistic device (Fig. 4).

Fig. 4 Sens, Museum: Tombstone

---

13 Concerning the sculpture of the façade of Sens Cathedral see Plein’s excellent work, *Die frühgotische Skulptur an der Westfassade der Kathedrale von Sens*. 
It turns out that this characteristic, which belongs to the art of the 1200s in Sens, reflects the specificity of antique art in the city: Sens was the pivot of Hellenic trends in Gaul. The female figures on the relief of the city’s thermal baths confirm that the sculptor of Sens copied this decoration. The features of the faces, the handling of the hair and the design of the eyes are similar to the sculpted figures of the cathedral. The head of a woman or of an angel (Fig. 5) could quite conceivably be compared to a woman on the frieze emerging from the thermal baths (Fig. 6). Then Chartres, Paris, and particularly Reims and Strasbourg, follow the movement and copy antique works. The sculptor working in around 1220 in the south transept of Strasbourg Cathedral adds the special feature of combining Byzantine references with antique references in sculpture. Whereas the torsion and the grace of the Synagogue come from the imitation of antique works, the distinctive posture of Marie-Madeleine kneeling on the ground, the left leg folded while the right leg passes under the left knee, the back arched and arms in a sign of supplication could come from a Byzantine motif, such as we find in the *Paris Psalter* (Paris, BNF, MS grec. 139, fol. 419v).

---

Fig. 6 Sens, Museum: Detail of a frieze emerging from the thermal baths

Fig. 7 Paris, BNF, MS lat. 16745, fol. 127: Capucins Bible
Moreover parallels with the Byzantine illuminators have been put forward by Jean-Philippe Meyer. Among others, he presents links between this sculptor and the *Hortus deliciarum*, made in Alsace in around 1200 and imbued with references to Byzantine art.¹⁶

In this artistic climate where goldsmiths and sculptors copy the stylistic system of antique works and are inspired by Byzantine motifs, what are the models used by the illuminators? Are they directed towards the same sources of inspiration? Just before 1200, contemporary goldsmiths’ art serves to support certain illuminators. Larry Ayres presented connections between the manuscripts created in northern France and the goldsmiths’ art and contemporary sculpture.¹⁷

The Christ in Majesty of the *Capucins Bible* created in Champagne circa 1180 (Paris, BNF, MS lat. 16745) has parallels with the Christ in Majesty of a champlevé enamel plaque preserved at the Metropolitan Museum of


New York (Fig. 7–8). The influence of the goldsmith’s art is already in full evidence some twenty years previously, a time when an illuminator readily recaptures an earlier work from almost half a century before. In effect, the Mosan illuminator creating a psalter in around 1160-1170, from which only a few fragments have survived (Berlin, Kupferstichkabinett, MS 78 A 6), copied, in reverse, a composition from the baptismal font at Liège (between 1107 and 1118) in order to create the scene of the Baptism of the Neophytes (fol. 9v) as Roland Recht observed.\(^\text{18}\) The goldsmith did not hesitate to copy a work half a century old. Certain motifs used by the goldsmiths are therefore found in circulation among the illuminators. The motif of a virtue (\textit{Fortitudo}) fighting a lion, recurring in the Meuse enamels from the middle of the twelfth century is imitated by the islander illuminators. They are found, among others, on the lower plate of a Gospel produced between 1150 and 1170 in the workshop of a Meuse goldsmith.\(^\text{19}\) The motif is recaptured for a figure of David versus the lion in the \textit{Winchester Bible} (Winchester, Cathedral Library, fol. 218r), for a figure of Samson versus the lion in the Psalter of Saint Louis (Leiden, University Library, BPL, MS 76A) and for a figure of \textit{Fortitudo} in the psalter of the Pierpont Morgan Library Glazier 25 (Fig. 9), created in England at the beginning of the thirteenth century. The Mosan goldsmiths’ art of the years 1160 to 1180 was for a long time a major source of inspiration for the illuminators. Contemporary sculpture is another contributing factor. The same \textit{Capucins Bible} (Fig. 10) adopts a style that is extremely close to the slightly earlier sculptures of the collegiate church of Notre-Dame of Mantes-la-Jolie.\(^\text{20}\) The drapery is soft and clings to the body in the same way. The light and shadow effects coming from the sculpture tends to give the painted portrayal a three-dimensional effect. The illuminator observes the works of the sculptors adopting the new style, which is in place in the third quarter of the twelfth century. Other pictorial trends, mainly on Germanic lands, directed themselves towards Byzantine sources. However, it remains unclear how the models are passed on. An example is the scene of the sleeping apostles in Gethsemane in the \textit{Hortus deliciarum} compiled in around 1200 in Strasbourg which presents clear links with Byzantine art. It was linked with the equivalent scene in Monreale.\(^\text{21}\) However, there are certain differences between the two scenes, suggesting


\(^\text{19}\) \textit{Ornamenta Ecclesiae}, cat. no. E 65, 278-281.

\(^\text{20}\) Ayres, “A Miniature from Jumièges and Trends in Manuscript Illumination around 1200”.

\(^\text{21}\) Demus, \textit{Byzantine Art and the West}, 40.
that they are not directly related to one another. And yet the differences resolve themselves when we look at the scene of the west wall of the refectory in the monastery of the Greek island of Patmos, produced about 1200.\(^\text{22}\) The composition of the *Hortus deliciarum* is closer to that of Patmos and certain details such as the sleeping apostle supporting his head with the right arm up, or again the two apostles sleeping head to head in the middle, present a closer proximity to Patmos than to Monreale. Thus, the *Hortus deliciarum* is not derived from Monreale but the two are very likely based on the same model, which is also used at Patmos. This model must have been found in the Byzantine Empire in a manuscript that circulated in the West in the second half of the twelfth century. The example demonstrates the importance of the Byzantine models at that time distributed by the circulation of manuscripts and sketchbooks.\(^\text{23}\) Another example: the illuminator of the *Goslar Gospels* reproduces the same henchman that inspired Nicholas of Verdun fifty years before (Fig. 1–3). Nicholas of Verdun had interpreted the model by dressing Samson in an antiquating short tunic and old shoes. On the other hand, the Goslar illuminator copied it as it was, keeping the same Byzantine clothes, therefore excluding the influence of the ambo, although he uses it in the same way as Nicholas: Samson carrying off the gates of Gaza. Thus, first in the Mosan region, and then in Saxony, two artists copied the same model several decades apart. The circulation of Byzantine illuminations in the West at this time seems to have been very wide. The famous *Ingeborg Psalter* demonstrates the orientation of the two illuminators towards Byzantine art and it can only be understood through access to a wide Byzantine repertoire that must have circulated through manuscripts. Florens Deuchler, who is responsible for an excellent monograph, which appeared in 1967, mentions a Byzantine iconographic reference for almost half the scenes.\(^\text{24}\)

---

\(^{22}\) Terrier Aliferis, *L’imitation de l’Antiquité*.

\(^{23}\) The so called Musterbuch of Wolfenbüttel is regarded to have had a strong impact on the illuminators’ style of the Gospels of Goslar, cf. Wolter- von dem Knesebeck, “Das Wolfenbütteler Musterbuch”; Geymonat, “Drawing, memory and imagination”.

\(^{24}\) Deuchler, *Der Ingeborgpsalter*; Avril, “L’atelier du Psautier d’Ingeburge: problèmes de localisation et de datation”.
The Models of the Illuminators in the Early Gothic Period

Fig. 9 New York, PML, MS Glazier 25, fol. 5v: Psalter

Fig. 10 Paris, BNF, MS lat. 16745, fol. 108: Capucins Bible
The Byzantine mosaics of the years 1150 to 1170 in Sicily contain several definite parallels but certain motifs can only be explained by the circulation of Byzantine manuscripts in the West. Florens Deuchler spotted the rarity of the composition of the Flight into Egypt (Fig. 11). Indeed, the Virgin is sitting astride the donkey but she does not hold the child on her knees. The latter is in the arms of Joseph who is behind the animal, while a servant leads the way. The Virgin makes a backwards movement to reach out to her son. This very special compositional arrangement appears on a stained glass window at Laon Cathedral (about 1205), it is then found on a stained glass window at Troyes Cathedral (1210–1220), then on the shrine of St Marc at Huy (given an approximate date of between 1210 and 1230), on a stained glass window at the Collegiate Church of Saint-Quentin (about 1220), then in Tuscany (about 1280). The diffusion in northern France, then later in Italy, suggests the circulation of this type of representations via a book of models based on a Byzantine composition. However, through my research to date I have been unable to find a Byzantine example before the

26 *The Year 1200, A Centennial Exhibition*, cat. no. 182, 176-177.
27 For the illustrations on the stained-glass windows of Laon and Saint-Quentin, as well as for the Tuscan panel conserved at the Museum of Decorative Arts in Paris, see Deuchler, *Der Ingeborgpsalter*, fig. 210-212.
The Models of the Illuminators in the Early Gothic Period

beginning of the fifteenth century, when it was in the church of Kalenic in Serbia.\(^{28}\) The link with the Palatine Chapel in Palermo, identified by Florens Deuchler\(^{29}\) does not seem to be direct. Ernst Kitzinger has indeed shown that in Palermo, Christ is carried by Joseph at the head of the procession in reference to the early Christian iconography of the triumphal entry of the emperor into a city.\(^{30}\) The iconographic choice can be explained in this case by the royal order of the scenes. In the aforementioned examples, Christ is interestingly relegated to the end of the procession while it is the servant who is leading the way. Or, if the reference is direct, the important change of the figures place must be analysed.

Thus, the work of Mosan goldsmiths and Byzantine art (accessible through the circulation of Byzantine manuscripts and sketchbooks) serve as models for the illuminators of northern Europe in the late twelfth century and during the first half of the thirteenth century. Of course, examples of scriptoria being revived are very common and they are used as models: for example, in England the designs circulating among the *Winchester Psalter* (British Museum, Royal MS 2. A. XXII, c. 1200), the *Glazier Psalter* (realised in London, 1220s) and the *Lindsey Psalter* (Society of Antiquaries, MS 59, realised in London between 1220 and 1222).\(^{31}\) The Christ in Majesty of the *Glazier Psalter* and that of the *Lindsey Psalter* indeed recapture the design of the *Winchester Psalter*. But the most interesting aspect of manuscript production in the years around 1200 is the link between England and the Continent (in particular with the scriptoria of northern France) often researched and referred to as the Channel Style.\(^{32}\) These connections have already been demonstrated on several occasions and are personified by Master Simon, active in Champagne and Saint-Albin, who brings the same decorative designs to

\(^{28}\) See “L’enfance du Christ d’après les collections byzantines de l’Université de Strasbourg”, dir. Stavros Lazaris, 2005: http://misha1.ustrasbg.fr/enfance_christ/articles/article6.html. See also the note by Velmans on the Kalenic church in his work *La peinture murale byzantine à la fin du Moyen Age*, 256.

\(^{29}\) Deuchler, *Der Ingeborgpsalter*, 40.

\(^{30}\) Kitzinger, “The Mosaics of the Capella Palatina in Palermo”.


\(^{32}\) Boase, *English Art 1100-1216*, 183 and the recent exhibition catalogue *Une renaissance. L’art entre Flandre et Champagne 1150-1250*. 
England and northern France, designs that are also found in Corbie.\textsuperscript{33} It is often impossible to know which places, French or English, are first responsible for the appearance of a design, since the designs are circulated simultaneously in both directions. However, one can sometimes determine if there is an influence on the other. A psalter executed in Normandy in around 1230, the \textit{Psalter of Evreux} (Municipal Library, MS 4) seems to refer to an English model, among others this is demonstrated by the very distinctive iconography of the initial “E” of Psalm 80 representing David playing before Saul (fol. 135), which does not appear on the Continent but several examples of which appear in England.\textsuperscript{34} This type of circulation of the illuminated models between England and the Continent, which also holds true in the windows,\textsuperscript{35} is particularly evident in the \textit{Psalter of Queen Ingeborg}. Ancient literature among other sources assumed that the psalter came from England, which is ruled out since the work of Florens Deuchler has proven that the psalter was produced in the region of Noyon-Laon-Soissons circa 1190–1210.\textsuperscript{36} However, the type of psalter itself containing an important illustration series comes from English tradition.\textsuperscript{37} It seems indeed that taking into account the Psalter of Louis, realized at the end of the twelfth century in England (Leiden, UL, BPL, MS 76A), it is safe to assume that at least one of the illuminators of the \textit{Ingeborg Psalter}, the one most influenced by Byzantium art, was in contact with English art. The system of partitioning scenes into two registers on a full page, the abundance of profiles, cheekbones enhanced by red circles, and the very frequent use of shrubs to make the composition more dynamic, is found in contemporary psalters in the one made for the second wife of Philippe Auguste. The gatherings of people, looks towards the viewer, or again the anti-naturalistic flight of clothing, seem to come from English art, which absorbs Byzantine models. These stylistic devices are indeed found in the

\footnotesize
33 Ayres, “A Miniature from Jumièges and Trends in Manuscript Illumination around 1200”.
35 The stained-glass windows of Trinity Chapel at Canterbury Cathedral serve as models for those at Sens Cathedral just after 1220, where the cult of Thomas Becket first grew. Reference to the “headquarters” of the saint’s cult is made by the use of graphic models brought directly from Canterbury to Sens. Caviness, \textit{The Early Stained Glass of Canterbury Cathedral}, 84-95. This passage between the two cities is even more interesting as just before this William of Sens had rebuilt Canterbury Cathedral, including the Trinity Chapel following the fire of 1174.
37 Deuchler, \textit{Der Ingeborgpsalter}, 163-164.
Psalter of Louis at the end of the twelfth century and persist in the windows of the Trinity Chapel in Canterbury, painted shortly before 1220. Similarly, the characters cut by the frame when they are part of a group, according to the principle of *et cetera* or an isolated character truncated by the frame (Fig. 12), rare in French illumination of the period, are frequently found in English art, particularly in the *Psalter of Louis* (Fig. 13, p. 16). You can still establish a similarity in the composition between folio 15 of the *Ingeborg Psalter*, the only folio in the psalter to present a triple scene by doubling the representation of the upper register with the Annunciation and the Visitation, and the Birth of Christ in the lower register and which strictly corresponds to the equivalent portfolio of the *Psalter of Louis* (Fig. 14–15). The scene of the Incredulity of Thomas represented in the two psalters also presents surprising proximities in composition (Fig. 16–17). Moreover, a comparison between the figure of Herod ordering the massacre of the children in the *Ingeborg Psalter* (Fig. 18) and the crowned figure of David of the English psalter from the collection of William S. Glazier (Fig. 19) made after the *Ingeborg Psalter* in the 1220s, reveals a close stylistic proximity between the facial features and the movement of the drapery. The links between the insular scriptoria and those of the northern Continent are directly and strictly contemporary.

Fig. 12 Chantilly, Condé Museum, MS 1695, fol. 26v: Ingeborg Psalter
Fig. 13 Leiden, UL, MS, BPL 76A, fol. 22v:
Louis Psalter

Fig. 14 Chantilly, Condé Museum, MS 1695, fol. 18v-19r
The Models of the Illuminators in the Early Gothic Period

Fig. 15 Leiden, UL, MS BPL 76A, fol. 15r: Louis Psalter

Fig. 16 Chantilly, Condé Museum, MS 1695, fol. 15r: Ingeborg Psalter
Fig. 17 Leiden, UL, MS BPL 76A, fol. 27r: Louis Psalter
Fig. 18 Chantilly, Condé Museum, MS 1695, fol. 18v: Ingeborg Psalter

Fig. 19 New York, PML, MS Glazier 25, fol. 4r: Psalter
Now let us turn to the issue of Antiquity, which is the main reference of the goldsmiths and sculptors in developing more naturalistic art around 1220. Does the art of the distant past also serve as a stylistic reference for the illuminators? As we shall see the answer appears to be no. The *Ingeborg Psalter* perfectly illustrates the graphic transposition around 1200 of the trend towards Antiquity and the style of the second master responsible for the illuminations is constantly featured. A priori, it seems that a study of antique sculpture would explain the stylistic approach of this artist, since his main characteristics are the fluidity of the drapery hugging the body, attention given to figures and above all, the illusion of a three-dimensional rendering by the subtle use of gradation in the folds of the garments. The *Missal of Anchin* (Douai, Municipal Library, MS 90), often cited as the stylistic match of the *Ingeborg Psalter*, indeed uses exactly the same method of gradation to achieve an illusion of three-dimensionality. These two illuminated collections are probably the only examples of this stylistic method in the illumination of the period.

Contemporary sculpture, especially that of Laon, was sometimes mentioned as a source of illumination, but it still had to demonstrate the role of Antiquity. I wanted to find out whether the three-dimensionality of the style of the second master of the *Ingeborg Psalter* derived from knowledge of Antiquity by comparing the miniatures with antique works, primarily with sculptures and bas-reliefs. The lack of results prompts me to exclude a direct study of antique sculpture. Not only does no particular motif come from Antiquity but also no parallel can be established in the arrangement of the folds. The source of his style is not there. Neither is it in Byzantine art, despite the direct links which connect the *Ingeborg Psalter* to Byzantine iconography or compositions.

Thus Byzantine motifs are fully revived by the two illuminators of the *Ingeborg Psalter*, but the source of the style of the second master is not in this form. Byzantine art, in effect, did not develop this subtle effect of gradation which increases the effect of three-dimensionality and which comes from sculpture. Florens Deuchler, then Iliana Kasarska, established the surprising stylistic parallels of the psalter with the façade of Laon Cathedral. The Angel of the Annunciation of the psalter is close to a damned soul on the lintel of the Portal of the Last Judgement; the same

---

38 Among others, Swarzenski, *Monuments of Romanesque Art. The art of church treasures in North-Western Europe*, fig. 540-543 and Deuchler, *Der Ingeborgpsalter*, 146 and 164.
40 Ibid.
ripple in the cloth of the Nativity Scene at Laon is reflected in the cloth of the cloak of the Mary’s Dormition; the fluidity of the drapery and the folds in «v» of the shepherd’s tunic are seen again on the companion of the Flight into Egypt. The proximity of the clothing and of the arrangement of the folds between Christ in Limbo and the sculpted Saint Michel suggests an additional parallel. Finally, one can draw a parallel between the angel of the north gate and the angel with Abraham in the psalter. So, the two artists referred to the contemporary sculpture of Laon Cathedral. The sculpture of the western facade of Laon Cathedral, completed in 1190, has been perceived, since the works of Willibald Sauerländer, as one of the first manifestations of monumental sculpture of the 1200 style. Thus, the stylistic source of the illuminators of the Ingeborg Psalter lies in contemporary sculpture. The technique of gradation cleverly placed inside the folds of the garments in order to create an illusion of three-dimensionality, was acquired by consulting and skilfully observing the sculptural innovations of previous years but not by consulting ancient works. The stylistic elegance, the fluidity of the drapery, the graceful manner in which the garments hang from the body, the attention given to the figures and the persuasive three-dimensionality come from the monumental sculpture developed in the cathedral of Laon whose style is also present at Saint-Yved in Braine probably through the presence of the same sculptor at both construction sites.

There is also a decline in the use of models after 1220 generally in the figurative arts and especially in illuminated production. Robert Branner, in his detailed study of the manuscripts produced in Paris in the thirteenth century, tends to deny the use of sketchbooks of models in favour of the routine use of motifs within the various workshops. Long-established production methods explain the repetitive aspect of certain motifs and certain compositional or iconographic patterns. The increase in book production in university towns reduces research into stylistic or iconographic innovations. The experimentations and emulations of the end of the twelfth century tend to blur in the face of growing demand and the need to work more quickly.

Thus, it appears that unlike the goldsmiths and sculptors, the illuminators do not turn to ancient models to develop their style. Of course, there are isolated exceptions where certain motifs have been reproduced, for example, the famous Spinario copied on the folio of the

41 Kasarska, La sculpture de la façade de la cathédrale de Laon.
42 Sauerländer, Gotische Skulptur in Frankreich.
43 Kasarska, La sculpture de la façade de la cathédrale de Laon, 223-226.
44 Branner, Manuscript painting in Paris during the Reign of Saint Louis, 16-22.
entry of Christ into Jerusalem from the *Gospel of Saint-Martin of Cologne*. 45 The continued spreading over the centuries of the Roman bronze erected in front of the Lateran Palace in Rome from 1165–1167,46 must have occurred in northern Europe through small bronze replicas distributed throughout the ancient Roman Empire. But then why do the illuminators not refer to Antiquity following the process developed by the best goldsmiths and sculptors of the years around 1200? The artists of the *Ingeborg Psalter* received a royal commission and the technical perfection that they demonstrate suggests that they were artists who were fully accomplished and most probably recognized. However, they adopt a different attitude to the goldsmiths and sculptors. To address this issue, we must first understand the motivations of the goldsmiths and sculptors in their choice of imitating the works of the past stylistically. How and for what reasons do they refer to Antiquity? Firstly, a study into the research of the antique models in the works of the 1200 style has enabled me to show that the artists refer to the works that they find close to where they are working, therefore in the provinces of the ancient Roman Empire. Trips to Rome or Greece do not seem to be responsible for the development of the antiquating style of the third quarter of the twelfth century. During this century, opinions about works of the past relics evolved. In the eleventh century, ancient ruins served mainly to establish the age of foundation. 47 During the 12th century, archaeological considerations were transformed into a strong admiration for ancient works. This enthusiasm, detectable through the few texts that have survived, has an effect on the technical and aesthetic perfection of the works. What emerges from these accounts primarily from 1150 onwards is the resemblance of the ancient works to sensory reality. Osbert de Clare, master Grégoire and Robert de Clari praise the naturalism of the objects

45 For the illustration of the scene of the Entry into Jerusalem in the Gospel, see *Ornamenta Ecclesiae*, 1985, cat. no. E 84, 306.
46 Bober and Rubinstein, *Renaissance artists and antique sculpture*, 235-236; *D’après l’antique*, cat. no. 47, 205-206.
47 In the second decade of the 12th century, the discovery of sarcophaguses allowed Guibert of Nogent to establish the Roman origin of Nogent (Guibert de Nogent, *Autobiographie*, 211-213). On the evolution of the facial expression of ancient statuary between 1050 and 1200, see the conclusion of Jean-Yves Tilliette, who in analysing three texts (by Bernard of Angers, Foulcoie of Beauvais and Master Gregory) noted a change in moral and aesthetic attitudes towards sculpture (“*Tamen horrore decorum. La statuaire antique au miroir de la littérature latine des Xle et XIIe siècles*”).
they observe with enthusiasm.\footnote{Terrier Aliferis, \textit{L'imitation de l'Antiquité}; Concerning Osbert de Clare, see Lehmann-Brockhaus, \textit{Lateinische Schriftquellen zur Kunst}, no. 6696, 422; Magister Gregorius, \textit{Narracio de mirabilius urbis Romae} § 3, Robert de Clari, \textit{La conquête de Constantinople}, 180.} This admiration for the resemblance of ancient statues to reality – which are lifelike – is one of the key elements of the attitude in the twelfth century towards the works of classical Antiquity and the strongest motivation for copying them. It is the Mosan goldsmiths who initiate the movement, in particular Nicholas of Verdun from 1180, then the sculptors a few years later. The major technical difference between the goldsmiths and the sculptors on the one hand and the illuminators on the other is the three-dimensional work. The Klosterneuburg ambo represents the first appearance of the stylistic imitation of Antiquity, but although it consists of a two-dimensional surface, it should be noted that the primary activity of the goldsmiths is sculpture in the round. The Shrine of the Three Kings demonstrates the perfect mastery in around 1200 of representations of sculpture in the round. Thus the fundamental difference in the work of the illuminators is of course the two-dimensional medium. One might therefore assume that the distinction in the choice of models is due to the difference in the medium: the sculptors and goldsmiths were orientated more towards three-dimensional models, while the painters choose influences carried by two-dimensional works, such as Byzantine manuscripts. However, we saw the debt of painters to the contemporary sculpture they imitate.

So it seems that the painters profit from the experiences gained by the goldsmiths and sculptors, who created art that was more compelling and more naturalistic based on works that seem to have been able to reproduce nature in a persuasive manner. In this first step towards acquiring an accomplished naturalism, artists refer first, of course, to works of art before turning directly to nature itself, the result that occurs around 1210 in Chartres, then in Reims, Paris and in the Empire with the imitation of foliage and then human anatomy. The antique sculptural works serve as models for learning. The painters then draw benefit from the new, more naturalistic style that has been developed and adopted it by referring to the goldsmiths and the sculptors who have managed to reach the stage of a more convincing representation by using the classical models. The painters no longer have to transpose the style of the antique works to contemporary themes: this step has already been performed. This is why we do not find stylistic imitation of Antiquity by the illuminators of the 1200s who, however, developed new compositions based on Byzantine
motifs while admiring the creations sculpted and made from gold of their contemporaries.

**Works cited**

**Primary sources**


**Secondary sources**


**Picture credits**

_Das Goslarer Evangeliar_, fac simile, Goslar: Stadt Goslar, 1991: Fig. 3.
Paris, BNF: Fig. 7, 10.
Cl. Musées de Sens: Fig. 5.
Klosterneuburg Abbey: Fig. 1.
Le Deschault de Monredon, Térence: Fig. 2.
Leiden, UL: Fig. 13, 15, 17.
New York, Metropolitan Museum: Fig. 8.
New York, PML, Gift of the Trustees of the William S. Glazier Collection, 1984: Fig. 9, 19.
RMN-Grand Palais (domaine de Chantilly) / René-Gabriel Ojéda: Fig. 11, 12, 14, 16, 18.
Terrier Aliferis, L.: Fig. 4, 6.