The strategic plan for combating antimicrobial resistance in Gulf Cooperation Council States

BALKHY, Hanan H, et al.

Abstract

The Gulf Cooperation Council Center for Infection Control (GCC-IC) has placed the emergence of antimicrobial resistance (AMR) on the top of its agenda for the past four years. The board members have developed the initial draft for the GCC strategic plan for combating AMR in 2014. The strategic plan stems from the WHO mandate to combat AMR at all levels. The need for engaging a large number of stakeholders has prompted the GCC-IC to engage a wider core of professionals in finalizing the plan. A multi-disciplinary group of more than 40 experts were then identified. And a workshop was conducted in Riyadh January 2015 and included, for the first time, representation of relevant ministries and agencies as well as international experts in the field. Participants worked over a period of two and a half days in different groups. International experts shared the global experiences and challenges in addressing human, food, animal, and environmental aspects of controlling AMR. Participants were then divided into 4 groups each to address the human, animal, microbiological and diagnostic, or the environmental aspect of AMR. At the end [...]
The strategic plan for combating antimicrobial resistance in Gulf Cooperation Council States

Hanan H. Balkhy, Abdullah M. Assiri, Haifa Al Mousa, Seif S. Al-Abri, Huda Al-Katheeri, Huda Alansari, Najiba M. Abdulrazzaq, Awa Aidara-Kane, Didier Pittet

a King Saud bin Abdulaziz University for Health Sciences, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
b Infection Prevention and Control Department King Abdulaziz Medical City, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
c GCC Center for Infection Control, Ministry of National Guard-Health Affairs, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
d Ministry of Health, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
e Ministry of Health, Kuwait, Kuwait
f Ministry of Health, Muscat, Oman
g Ministry of Public Health, Doha, Qatar
h Ministry of Health, Almanamah, Bahrain
i Ministry of Health, United Arab Emirates
j Department of Food Safety and Zoonosis, World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland
k Infection Control Programme and World Health Organization Collaborating Centre on Patient Safety, University of Geneva Hospitals, Geneva, Switzerland

KEYWORDS
Strategic plan; Antimicrobial resistance; AMR; GCC; Saudi Arabia; United Arab Emirates; Qatar;

Summary The Gulf Cooperation Council Center for Infection Control (GCC-IC) has placed the emergence of antimicrobial resistance (AMR) on the top of its agenda for the past four years. The board members have developed the initial draft for the GCC strategic plan for combating AMR in 2014. The strategic plan stems from the WHO mandate to combat AMR at all levels. The need for engaging a large number of stakeholders has prompted the GCC-IC to engage a wider core of professionals in finalizing the plan. A multi-disciplinary group of more than 40 experts were then identified. And a workshop was conducted in Riyadh January 2015 and included, for the first time, representation of relevant ministries and agencies as well as international experts in the field. Participants worked over a period of two and a
Introduction

The ongoing emergence and spread of antimicrobial resistance (AMR) in bacteria is leading medicine to a post-antibiotic era [1,2]. Urinary-tract infections (UTI), for example, are increasingly caused by bacteria that are resistant to last-line antibiotics [3,4]. Gram-negative bacilli colistin resistance [5] and Pan-drug resistance are being reported more frequently [6,7]. In essence, antimicrobial resistance is not a new phenomenon [8]. Identification of penicillin-resistant bacterial strains has been documented as early as 1940 [9]. While the reliance on antimicrobial agents has led to the advancement of medicine that we see today, such as implantable devices through complex surgical procedures, organ and stem cell transplant, and cures for many advanced cancers that have led to the survival of significantly immunocompromised patients. These interventions would not have been possible without the existence of antimicrobial agents [10]. On the other hand, the misuse of these agents through the lack of hospital and community-based stewardship programs, poor compliance with infection control policies, limited incentives for developing new agents, lack of global surveillance, and limited availability of affordable rapid diagnostics for AMR, have all played a significant role in enhancing the emergence and widespread distribution of AMR [11]. This is a true threat to modern medicine as we know it today.

To mitigate this threat, the WHO launched the Global Action Plan on Antimicrobial Resistance with the "One Health" approach [12]. Despite this not being the first attempt for a global action plan, the "One Health" approach is in desperate need of recognition and global acknowledgment. The plan consists of five pillars: to improve awareness of AMR, to increase knowledge through surveillance, to reduce the incidence of infection, to optimize the use of antimicrobial agents, and to develop the economic case for sustainable investment in all countries with regards to new and affordable medicines, diagnostic tools, vaccines, and other interventions [12]. As a response to this action plan different countries, including the United Kingdom [13], Australia [14], Canada [15], and the United States [16], initiated their own national AMR action plans. The most notable similarity between them is the willingness of the countries to tackle AMR in human and animal health as well as in food, agriculture, and the environment sectors. Here, we describe the GCC initiative to join the global community in addressing AMR.

The increasing threat of AMR in the GCC States

Countries of the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) are a political and economic union. Constituent countries include: The Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, Sultanate Oman, United Arab Emirates (UAE), Kuwait, Qatar, and the Kingdom of Bahrain. Several factors have been linked to the emergence and spread of AMR in this region [17,18]. Heavy international travel due to the large population of expatriate workers, booming tourism in several of the countries, and the hosting of over 4 million pilgrims throughout the year to the holy cities of Mecca and Madinah in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia [19–22]; where travel is a known risk factor for acquiring and transmitting antibiotic resistant bacteria [22,23]. And similar to other countries worldwide, the GCC countries face challenges with adherence of healthcare providers to infection control practices. The lack of primary healthcare systems and legislation on the prudent and responsible use of antimicrobials is a shared concern. Most hospitals have no established
stewardship programs and community pharmacies frequently dispense antimicrobial agents with no prescription [17]. Furthermore, the use of antibiotics is prevalent and without supervision in the treatment of animals, and in some of the countries there is growing evidence that antibiotics are used as growth promoters [24,25]. As a result, a significant AMR burden has been described in the GCC region [26,27]; including: Extended Spectrum Beta-Lactamase (ESBL) producing bacteria [20,28], Carbapenemase-producing bacteria [29], Pan-drug-resistant Gram-negative bacilli (GNB) [6], as well as multidrug-resistant tuberculosis [27]. Between 60 and 90% of Klebsiella pneumoniae isolates are ESBL producers [18], which is associated with up to 40% mortality [30]. Additionally, 60–90% of Acinetobacter causing ventilator-associated pneumonia were shown to be resistant to most tested antimicrobials, including carbapenems, with significant negative clinical impact [29,31]. Multidrug resistant organisms were implicated in 20% of mortality caused by bloodstream infections in pediatric hematol...
geared toward infection control workshops, surveillance training programs, hand hygiene monitoring education workshops, and many other programs, including a biannual GCC-IC symposium, hosted by a GCC member country.

The process of developing the GCC AMR strategic plan

AMR rose to the top of the GCC-IC board meeting agenda in 2013. During the first months of discussing AMR, the countries shared their experience and conducted a situational analysis that discussed in detail the gaps identified and the efforts needed to combat AMR. The involvement of multiple stakeholders and the fact that they report to ministries or agencies other than the Ministry of Health was a clear initial challenge that needed to be addressed. The members conducted a detailed literature review on AMR and developed the initial draft for the GCC AMR strategic plan in 2014. The next step was to engage, through a workshop, all necessary stakeholders for input and to finalize the strategic plan for the countries to adopt. In January 2015, the GCC-IC arranged for the workshop and finalized the AMR strategic plan described here. Participants of the workshop included representatives from Ministry of Health, Ministry of Agriculture, Infectious Disease Societies, Academic and Research Centers, and Food and Drug Authority and were from all GCC countries. In April 2015, the center managed to finalize the GCC AMR strategic plan representing the collective expert views of the stakeholders; which complements the global action plan issued by the WHO in 2001 and again in 2015 [12]. It is very important to emphasize that this GCC strategic plan for combating AMR does not replace the need for developing tailored national strategic plans.

This endeavor is following the lead of the European Union (EU), whose AMR initiative is a remarkable example [60]. By sharing statistics, unifying surveillance methods, and transparency in revealing the strength and limitations of their data; the EU plays a leading role in policy development and experience sharing for the sake of reducing the impact of AMR in their countries, as well as others. A second example of addressing AMR in a challenging environment was by India in announcing the Chennai declaration [61]. The declaration resulted after the first meeting of most medical societies in India and representatives from local and international medical and health authorities. The meeting discussed the need to tackle AMR and set a plan to draw a road map addressing the AMR challenge from the Indian perspective [61]. The following section is summarizing the recommendations addressed in the GCC strategic plan for combating AMR.

The GCC strategic plan for combating AMR

Five strategic aims are identified as the pillars of the GCC AMR strategic plan: first, countries must develop an understanding of the magnitude of AMR in the GCC countries among humans and animals, as well as in agriculture and the environment. Second, countries must restrict the use of the available and limited effective agents to preserve their efficiency. Third, countries should develop early identification capacity for emerging MDR microorganisms. Fourth, countries should limit the spread of resistant pathogens through patients, animals, and agriculture. Finally, countries must encourage collaborative research activities regarding AMR in humans, animals, and the environment.

There are clear and significant challenges in addressing this plan in different countries. The initial challenge is soliciting support from leadership. Heads of state need to be able to empower and hold responsible ministries/agencies accountable for adopting the plan. Another challenge is agreeing on the appropriate key performance indicators (KPIs). Further, to provide the logistical support for the execution and maintenance of any initiative in any and all involved sectors.

In summary, the GCC AMR strategic plan addressed herein aims to draw a road map for the implementation of a tailored national action plan in every GCC country. The action plan is particularly important for improving adherence to stringent infection control measures, applying regulations controlling antibiotic use in both human and animal sectors, implementing proactive surveillance of resistance, and enhance awareness and education about AMR among healthcare workers, public, veterinarians, and the food sectors.

Elements of the strategic plan

I. Develop an understanding of the magnitude of AMR in the GCC countries among humans and animals as well as in agriculture and the environment

- Laboratory (human):
  - Measurable elements:
    a. Ensure access to microbiology laboratory services that match the level of those provided by hospitals (e.g., secondary, tertiary).
II. Preserve the available and limited effective agents for human use

- Legislation

  Measurable elements:
  a. Link the dispensing of all antimicrobial agents to a prescription and unique prescriber/pharmacist identifiers.
  b. Identify a restricted list of antibiotics that will not be available in community pharmacies.

c. Monitor the trend of the amount of antimicrobial use through a defined daily does/days of therapy (DDD/DOT) [64].

d. Develop standards for selecting and using generic antimicrobial agents that meet international standards of quality, safety, and efficacy when granting marketing authorization.

e. Restrict the use of the CIA in animals [62,63].

f. Require obligatory prescriptions by licensed veterinarians for all antimicrobials used for disease control in food animals.

g. Terminate or rapidly phase out the use of antimicrobials for growth promotions.

h. Create national systems to monitor antimicrobial usage in food animals according to the World Organization for Animal Health (OIE) standards [65].

i. Introduce legal requirements for manufacturers to collect and report data on antimicrobial distribution (including import/export).

j. Create economic incentives for the appropriate use of antimicrobials.

k. Introduce requirements for pharmaceutical companies to comply with national or international codes of practice on promotional activities.

l. Ensure that national or international codes of practice cover direct-to-consumer advertising, including advertising on the Internet.

m. Develop and legislate adult and pediatric vaccine programs including, but not limited to, influenza, pneumococcal, and conjugate meningococcal vaccines.

- Prescriber

  Measurable elements:
  a. Educate all groups of antimicrobial prescribers and dispensers on:
     • The importance of appropriate antimicrobial use and containment of antimicrobial resistance.
     • Disease prevention, specifically, immunization programs and infection control.
     • Factors that may strongly influence their prescribing habits, such as economic incentives, promotional activities and inducements by the pharmaceutical industry.
     • Educating patients on antimicrobial use and the importance of adherence to prescribed treatments.
b. Encourage the development and use of Antimicrobial guidelines and treatment algorithms to foster the appropriate use of antimicrobials.

c. Improve antimicrobial use by the supervision and support of clinical practices, especially diagnostic and treatment strategies.

d. Audit prescribing and dispensing practices and utilize peer group or external standard comparisons to provide feedback and endorsements of appropriate antimicrobial prescribing.

e. Promote targeted undergraduate and postgraduate educational programs on the accurate diagnosis and management of common infections for all health care providers and veterinarians.

f. Establish an Essential Drugs List (EDL) consistent with national and WHO STGs and ensure the accessibility and quality of these drugs [66].

- Patient 
**Measurable elements:**

a. Educate patients and the general community on the appropriate use of antimicrobials.

b. Educate patients on the importance of measures to prevent infection, such as immunization, hygiene, and cough etiquette.

c. Educate patients on suitable alternatives to antimicrobials for the relief of symptoms, and discourage patient self-initiation of treatment, except in specific circumstances.

d. Educate patients on simple measures that may reduce transmission of infection in the household and community, such as hand washing, food hygiene, and so on.

e. Encourage appropriate and informed health care seeking behavior.

f. Educate students in primary, elementary, and high schools about personal hygiene and how to prevent the spread of infections.

III. Develop the ability for the early identification of emerging MDR microorganisms

- Improve access to and the use of surveillance data in human, animal, food, and environment sectors through new arrangements that facilitate greater consistency and standardization of the data collected across the system and encourage improved data linkage

**Measurable elements:**

a. Adopt a unified method to conduct systematic surveillance on MDR organisms from the clinical laboratories through available WHO tools and make the data publicly available for the policy makers and the public

b. Adopt a unified method to identify the burden of MDR organisms on HAIs starting by major HAIs such as central line-associated bloodstream infection (CLABSI), ventilator-associated pneumonia (VAP), and surgical site infections (SSIs); and make the data publicly available to policy makers and the public [58].

c. Designate or develop reference microbiology laboratory facilities to coordinate effective epidemiologically sound surveillance of antimicrobial resistance among common pathogens in the community, hospitals, and other health care facilities.

d. Adopt World Organization for Animal Health (OIE) standards for surveillance in the animal sector [65].

- Make the responsible body accountable to the prompt action on these data

**Measurable elements:**

a. Identify infection prevention and control (IPC) programs in the hospital as separate departments reporting to the highest authority.

b. Make IPC accountable for leading such activities outlined in (a) and (b) of the previous point.

IV. Limit the spread of resistant pathogens through patients, animals, and agriculture

- Humans

**Measurable elements:**

a. Monitor and improve infection prevention and control practices in healthcare facilities.

b. Establish an inter hospital transfer system that ensures the identification of patients with MDR organisms between hospitals in one country and the transfer of patients between hospitals to and from different GCC countries to encourage proper isolation precautions.

c. Improve the healthcare systems within the GCC countries to ensure minimum infection control requirements while contracting new facilities or renovating old ones.

- Animals:

**Measurable elements:**

a. Monitor and improve infection prevention and control practices in animal health, both through the enhanced dissemination and implementation of best practices and the better use of data, diagnostics, and vaccines.

b. Enhance the availability of veterinarians to prioritize the diagnosis of disease in
livestock, poultry, and companion animals and to encourage the early use of appropriate diagnostic testing, in particular, bacterial culture and sensitivity testing.

c. Make available the use of vaccines in husbandry.

d. Encourage livestock farmers to adhere to government guidance regarding bio-security, animal husbandry and for farm health planning for each of the major farming sectors and to take proactive measures to reduce the risk of disease occurring in their animals under experienced veterinarian supervision.

e. Consider the use of ‘farm assurance schemes’ as a mechanism to increase adherence to best husbandry including the isolation of sick animals, testing new stock, and the responsible use of antibiotic by veterinarians only while ensuring animal health and welfare.

f. Encouraging retailers to review their standards for meat and animal products and to set clear specifications concerning bio-security, antimicrobial stewardship and good husbandry throughout the supply chain for overseas as well as national meat and animal products, working with suppliers and veterinarians to ensure compliance, all in accordance with the World Trade Organization (WTO) guidelines that are set by World Organization for Animal Health (OIE), the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO), the Codex, and the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPPC) [67–70].

g. Implement standard screening protocols for animal trading.

V. Encourage collaborative research activities regarding AMR in humans, animals and the environment

Measurable elements:

a. Identify and provide financial support for research projects in the AMR field as a national priority.

b. Make academic centers and funding agencies within the GCC countries aware of this priority.

c. Include all relevant sectors, such as healthcare, food and drug regulatory agencies, veterinarian care, and agriculture and environmental agencies.

d. Conduct research that measures the effectiveness of interventions such as drug restriction, guidelines, campaigns, and other strategies.

Moving forward

Significant progress on this issue has been accomplished through the past few years. Networking has taken place to identify key players. They have acknowledged the importance of AMR and the immediate need for a national/regional strategic action plan. The plan is now at the stage of full adaptation at the highest national level and for countries to identify an accountable body to oversee its implementation. This will take time to establish, allocate resources, and identify KPIs as well as to train the involved personal. In order to sustain this momentum, the GCC-IC will conduct an annual AMR workshop to address the success and share experiences on the progress and challenges of implementation. Further, countries will be given a platform to announce and raise awareness on this issue through the Journal of Infection and Public Health (JIPH). In the upcoming issues of this journal country specific achievements will be published.

Acknowledgments

We would like to thank the GCC-IC board members for producing the initial strategic plan and members from the GCC countries who attended the workshop and provided critical input. We would like to thank DP, AAK and EEV for providing the global perspective on the topic and for their support and input on the progress of this group. We thank AA, SMA, SA, MQ for leading the 4 subgroups during the workshop and AE and HZ for providing significant input in the literature review of this document. We would also like to thank the Health Ministers Council for Gulf Cooperation Council for their continuous support to the GCC-IC activities. Finally, we would like to appreciate and thank the Ministry of National Guard Health Affairs for hosting the GCC-IC center as its headquarters and hosting this workshop.

References


The GCC strategic plan for combating AMR


Collaborators at the workshop

Didier Pittet\textsuperscript{a}
Awa Aida-Kane\textsuperscript{b}
Elisabeth Erlacher-Vindel\textsuperscript{c}
Hail Mater Al Abdely\textsuperscript{d}
Adel Al Othman\textsuperscript{e}
Sameera M. Al Johani\textsuperscript{f}
Abubaker Fadlelmula\textsuperscript{g}
Aiman El-Saeed\textsuperscript{h}
Gregory Poff\textsuperscript{i}
Abdulrahman Al Habrawy\textsuperscript{j}
Yousuf Al Omi\textsuperscript{k}
Alaa Saeed Mutlaq\textsuperscript{l}
Ahmed Hakawi\textsuperscript{m}
Mohammed Al Zahrani\textsuperscript{n}
Sami Al Hajjar\textsuperscript{o}
Sahar Al Thawadi\textsuperscript{p}
Ali M. Somily\textsuperscript{q}
Hosam Al Zowawi\textsuperscript{r,s}
Saeed Al Shahrani\textsuperscript{t}
Mohamed Al Quwaizini\textsuperscript{u}
Ali Al Sahaaf\textsuperscript{v}
Mohammed Fayez Ahmed Salim\textsuperscript{w}
Kamal Hossein Zidan\textsuperscript{x}
Safaa Abdulaziz El Khawajah\textsuperscript{y}
Jameela Al-Salman\textsuperscript{z}
Nermin Kamal Hasan Mohamed Saeed\textsuperscript{A}

\textsuperscript{a}University of Geneva Hospitals and Faculty of Medicine, Geneva, Switzerland
\textsuperscript{b}Department of Food Safety and Zoonosis, World Health Organization, Switzerland
\textsuperscript{c}Scientific and Technical Department, World Organization for Animal Health (OIE), France
\textsuperscript{d}Health Facilities, Infection Control, Saudi Ministry of Health, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{e}Adult Infectious Diseases, Department of Medicine, Ministry of National Guard Health Affairs (MNGHA), Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{f}Microbiology, Laboratory & Pathology Department, MNGHA, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{g}Infection Prevention & Control, MNGHA, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{h}Infection Prevention & Control and GCC-IC, MNGHA, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{i}Saudi Medication Safety Center, MNGHA, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{j}Executive Board of Health Ministers’ Council for GCC States, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{k}Saudi Ministry of Health, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{l}Clinical Pharmacist, MOH, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{m}Infectious Diseases, KFMC, Saudi Ministry of Health, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{n}Security Forces Hospital, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{o}Saudi Pediatrics Infectious Diseases Society, King Faisal Specialist Hospital and Research Center (KFSH-RC), Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{p}Consultant of Microbiology & Chief of Laboratories Department, KFSH-RC, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{q}King Khalid University (KKU), Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{r}The University of Queensland, UQ Centre for Clinical Research, Herston, Queensland, Australia
\textsuperscript{s}KSAU-HS, MNGHA, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{t}Saudi FDA, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{u}SFDA, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
\textsuperscript{v}Ministry of Agriculture (MOA), Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
The GCC strategic plan for combating AMR

w MOA, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
x Veterinary Diagnostic Laboratory, MOA, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
y Infectious Diseases, MOH, Bahrain
z Bahrain
A Medical Microbiologist Chief Resident, MOH, Bahrain
B MOH, Kuwait
C Internist and Head of Infection Control Committee in MOH, United Arab Emirates
D Microbiologist and Head of IC, Royal Hospital, Oman
E Infectious Diseases, Royal Hospital, Oman
F Pediatric Infectious Diseases, Royal Hospital, Oman
G Microbiologist & Head of IC, Khoula Hospital, Oman
H Head of Infection Control, Nizwa Hospital, Oman
I Clinical Pharmacist, Khoula Hospital, Oman
J Public Health Specialist, Qatar
K Regional Leader, Qatar
L Clinical Pharmacist, Senior Clinical Instructor, Qatar
M Pharmaceutical Supervisor, Qatar
N Pediatric and Chairperson IC, HGH, Qatar
O General Surgery Specialist, Qatar