Tunable conductivity threshold at polar oxide interfaces


Abstract
The physical mechanisms responsible for the formation of a two-dimensional electron gas at the interface between insulating SrTiO3 and LaAlO3 have remained a contentious subject since its discovery in 2004. Opinion is divided between an intrinsic mechanism involving the build-up of an internal electric potential due to the polar discontinuity at the interface between SrTiO3 and LaAlO3, and extrinsic mechanisms attributed to structural imperfections. Here we show that interface conductivity is also exhibited when the LaAlO3 layer is diluted with SrTiO3, and that the threshold thickness required to show conductivity scales inversely with the fraction of LaAlO3 in this solid solution, and thereby also with the layer's formal polarization. These results can be best described in terms of the intrinsic polar-catastrophe model, hence providing the most compelling evidence, to date, in favour of this mechanism.

Reference

DOI : 10.1038/ncomms1936
The physical mechanisms responsible for the formation of a two-dimensional electron gas at the interface between insulating SrTiO$_3$ and LaAlO$_3$ have remained a contentious subject since its discovery in 2004. Opinion is divided between an intrinsic mechanism involving the build-up of an internal electric potential due to the polar discontinuity at the interface between SrTiO$_3$ and LaAlO$_3$, and extrinsic mechanisms attributed to structural imperfections. Here we show that interface conductivity is also exhibited when the LaAlO$_3$ layer is diluted with SrTiO$_3$, and that the threshold thickness required to show conductivity scales inversely with the fraction of LaAlO$_3$ in this solid solution, and thereby also with the layer’s formal polarization. These results can be best described in terms of the intrinsic polar-catastrophe model, hence providing the most compelling evidence, to date, in favour of this mechanism.
Remarkable and unexpected phenomena have been discovered at oxide heterostructure interfaces, which have a fundamental and potentially technological impact on future oxide-based devices. A paradigm example is the observed two-dimensional conductivity at the LaAlO$_3$/SrTiO$_3$ (LAO/STO) interface, originally explained in terms of the so-called polar-catastrophe scenario.

In this model, an intrinsic electronic reconstruction at the interface is expected from the build-up of an internal electrical potential in LAO as the film thickness $t$ increases, owing to the polar discontinuity at the interface between LAO, which consists of alternating positively and negatively charged layers, (LaO)$^+$ and (AlO)$_2^-$, and STO, with charge-neutral layers.

The main success of the polar-catastrophe scenario is that it very accurately predicts the critical thickness $t_c$ originally observed experimentally by Thiel et al., a very robust result that has been replicated in several laboratories and also predicted from first-principles calculations on ideal STO/LAO/vacuum stacks. However, the surface of LAO and its interface with STO are far from ideal, therefore alternative and extrinsic effects have been invoked to explain the observed conductivity, such as oxygen vacancies, adsorbates at the LAO surface, or interfacial intermixing. Also, the presence of an internal electric field within LAO, a key feature of the intrinsic scenario, was seriously questioned from X-ray photoemission measurements. Nonetheless, more recent surface X-ray diffraction measurements revealed both an atomic rumpling in the LAO layer, a clear signature of an internal electric field, and an expansion of the LAO $c$-axis unit-cell parameter, fully compatible with an electrostrictive effect produced by the same field.

From the above, it is clear that further compelling evidence in favour of one mechanism or the other is urgently required to obtain a unifying consensus about this fascinating system. Here we describe experiments performed to further assess the relative importance of the intrinsic polar-catastrophe scenario and the extrinsic intermixing model to explain the origin of the conductivity. To achieve this, we replaced pure LAO with ultrathin films of LAO diluted with STO, with charge-neutral layers.

The electric field in LAO will bend the electronic bands, as illustrated in Fig. 1a. At a thickness $t_c$, the valence O 2p bands of LAO at the surface reach the level of the STO Ti 3d conduction bands at the interface and a Zener breakdown occurs. Above this thickness, electrons will be transferred progressively from the surface to the interface, which hence becomes metallic (Fig. 1b–d). This simple electrostatic model not only explains the conduction, but also links the formal polarization of LAO, its dielectric constant, and $t_c$ such that

$$t_c = \frac{\varepsilon \varepsilon_0 E_{LAO} \Delta E}{E_{PLA0}},$$

where $\Delta E=3.3$ eV is the difference of energy between the valence band of LAO and the conduction band of STO, and $\varepsilon$ is the electron charge. This yields an estimate of $t_c \approx 3.5$ monolayers (ML), in perfect agreement with experiment.

Varying the composition of the LASTO$_x$ films (that is, $x$) allows one to tune continuously the formal polarization such that $P_{LASTO,x} = xP_{PLA0}$. For instance, for $x = 0.5$, the random solid solution has alternating planes with +0.5 and −0.5 formal charges.
The critical thickness expressed in equation (1) must, however, also consider possible changes of the other fundamental quantities determining the critical thickness as a function of the composition or thickness of the layers (\(n_f\)). The energy gap \(\Delta E\) formally depends on the electronic bandgap of STO and the valence-band offset \(\phi_v\) (Fig. 1) between the two materials, which can evolve with \(x\). In practice, however, the O 2p valence band of STO and LAO (\(x=1\)) are virtually aligned (\(\phi_v=0.1\ eV\) (ref. 11)) and \(\phi_v\) further diminishes with \(x\), so that we can confidently approximate \(\Delta E = E_{STO}\), irrespective of the composition. The dielectric constants of STO and LAO, however, differ significantly (\(\varepsilon_{STO}=300\), \(\varepsilon_{LAO}=24\) at room temperature) and it is not obvious a priori how the dielectric constant of the solid solution will evolve with composition. To clarify this point, we performed first-principles calculations on bulk compounds of different compositions using a supercell technique (see Methods). Although the dielectric constant of the LASTO:0.5 evolves slightly with the atomic arrangement, we observe that it remains essentially constant for \(x=1\), 0.75 and 0.5. This result may initially seem surprising; however, the large dielectric constant of pure STO is mainly produced by a low-frequency and highly polar phonon mode related to its incipient ferroelectric character. This mode, absent in LAO, is very sensitive to atomic disorder and is stabilized at much larger frequencies through mixing with other modes for \(x>0.5\) without contributing significantly to the dielectric constant. Hence, from the discussion above, it seems that varying the composition of the LASTO:x films (0.5\(\leq x < 1\)) allows one to tune the formal polarization while keeping the other quantities in equation (1) essentially constant, that is,

\[
t_{c}^{LASTO:x} = t_{c}^{LAO}/x. \tag{2}
\]

On the basis of this argument, we therefore predict that \(t_{c}=7\) ML and 5 ML for \(x=0.5\) and 0.75, respectively, a result confirmed for \(x=0.50\) from first-principles calculations (see Methods).

**Structural and electrical properties of the LASTO:x films.** The crystallographic quality of the films is shown in Fig. 2a. Growth was layer-by-layer, as also seen from clear RHEED oscillations and the atomic flatness observed in atomic-force micrographs. All films were perfectly strained. The out-of-plane lattice constant of the LASTO:0.5 films was determined to be 3.83±0.01 Å, in agreement with *ab-initio* calculations for strained growth on STO (the pseudocubic lattice parameter of the bulk pulsed laser-deposition (PLD) target was 3.85±0.01 Å). No evidence could be found either in plane or out of plane from superstructure peaks that there was any spontaneous ordering of the cations, at least for superstructures with a periodicity an even multiple of that of the normal unit cell.

Neither of the mixed-composition film stoichiometries investigated produce layers that increase in conductance with thickness, as one might otherwise expect for intermixed materials that were intrinsically electrically conducting. In addition, none of the films are conducting at the top surface, but instead require careful bonding at the interface to exhibit conductivity. These metallic interfaces were characterized for their transport properties using the van der Pauw method. All samples remained metallic down to the lowest measured temperature of 1.5 K. The sheet carrier densities \(n_s\) are in the range 3 to 15×10^13 cm\(^{-2}\), although with no obvious dependence on composition or thickness of the layers (Fig. 2b).

According to the polar-catastrophe model, we should expect LASTO:x samples to exhibit a lower carrier density, as the screening charge scales as \(x^{-2}\), whereby \(S\) is the unit-cell surface area. However, as already observed for LAO/STO interfaces, the estimation of the carrier density from the Hall effect yields values up to one order of magnitude smaller than those predicted from theory, possibly suggesting a large amount of trapped interface charges\(^{26}\). This can explain the known scattering of data from one sample to another, irrespective of composition or layer thickness, and precludes the possibility of testing the polar-catastrophe scenario simply from inspection of \(n_s\). The Hall mobility \(\mu (\sim 500\cm^2\V^{-1}\s^{-1}\) at 1.5 K) and sheet resistance (\(\sim 20\k Omega\square\) at room temperature) of the LASTO:x interfaces measured as a function of temperature exhibit essentially the same dependence as those for the interfaces with pure LAO films\(^{27}\). To probe experimentally the dielectric constant, capacitors were fabricated with different thicknesses of pure LAO and the \(x=0.5\) films, using palladium as the top electrode. A serious complication in measurements of such ultrathin films is the significant contribution of the electrode–oxide interface on the capacitance\(^{28}\), which means that the results can only be viewed semi-quantitatively. We observe that the dielectric constants of the LASTO:0.5 and LAO display values in the range of 20 to 30, and are in good agreement with previous reports on ceramic solid-state solutions, where no large enhancement of the relative permittivity was observed for the solid solution up to 80% STO\(^{29}\). Measurements of the temperature dependence and the electric-field tunability confirm that LASTO:x behaves like LAO rather than STO. Cooling the films to 4 K produces a small change of the dielectric constant, in sharp contrast with the low-temperature divergence of STO. These experimental results show that there is no large enhancement of the dielectric constant in LASTO:0.5 with respect to pure LAO, as predicted by our *first-principles* calculations.

**Discussion**

The striking result shown in Fig. 3 demonstrates that the critical thickness depends on \(x\), increasing as the formal polarization decreases. The thresholds in conductivity obtained from the experimental data are only very marginally smaller than predicted by theory, which can easily be attributed to the uncertainty in the dielectric constants of the solid solutions. The overall agreement, however, with the predictions of the intrinsic polar-catastrophe model described by equation (1) is remarkable.

![Figure 2 | Structural and transport characterization.](image-url)
In contrast, it is difficult, or, at least, it demands a significantly more complex model, to explain the observed dependence of the threshold thickness with $x$ in terms of the extrinsic phenomena of interfacial intermixing or oxygen vacancies. It would require that the ‘correct’ composition to provide conductivity is only achieved to a threshold thickness with $x$. We can envisage no such scenario explained by intermixing or oxygen vacancies. Using the principle of Occam’s razor, we therefore consider both extrinsic mechanisms to be far less plausible candidates.

In conclusion, we have shown that, in heterostructures of ultrathin films of the solid solution (LaAlO$_3$)$_x$(SrTiO$_3$)$_{1-x}$ grown on (001) SrTiO$_3$, the critical thickness, at which conductivity is observed, scales with the strength of the built-in electric field of the polar material. These results test the fundamental predictions of the polar-catastrophe scenario and provide compelling evidence in favour of the intrinsic origin of the doping at the LAO/STO interface.

**Methods**

**Sample preparation.** Two independent series of LASTO$_x$ films were prepared by PLD using different sets of growth parameters. The first set of films, produced at the Paul Scherrer Institut, was grown on (001) STO substrates using two different PLD sintered targets, with $x = 0.50$ and 0.75. Neither target ($>85\%$ dense) was conducting. Growth conditions using 266-nm Nd:YAG laser radiation were: pulse energy $= 16$ mJ ($>2$ cm$^{-2}$), $10$ Hz; $T = 750^\circ$C; $P_{O_2} = 2.5 \times 10^{-1}$ mbAr; sample cooled after growth at $25$ C/min and post-annealed for $1$ hr in $1$ atm. $O_2$ at $550^\circ$C. The second set of films was grown at the University of Geneva using standard growth conditions: KrF laser (248 nm) with a pulse energy of $50$ mJ ($>0.6$ cm$^{-2}$), $1$ Hz; $T = 800^\circ$C. $P_{O_2} = 1 \times 10^{-4}$ mbAr; sample cooled after growth to $550^\circ$C in $200$ mbAr $O_2$ and maintained at this temperature and pressure for $1$ hr before being cooled to room temperature in the same atmosphere. Both the annealing conditions produced fully oxidized films and interfacial intermixing or oxygen vacancies, which were kept away from the low-temperature conditions known to produce interfacial conductivity via oxygen diffusion driven by redox reactions. The stoichiometries of the films from both sets were shown by Rutherford backscattering to be equal to the nominal PLD-target compositions of $0.5$ and $0.75$ to within the experimental accuracy of $1.5\%$.

**First-principles calculations.** First-principles calculations were performed in the framework of density-functional theory. The electronic system was described using the so-called BI-WC hybrid functional, which mixes the GGA functional of Wu and Cohen with $16\%$ of exact-exchange within the BI scheme, and is known to be particularly accurate for the description of the electronic properties and structure of the LAO/STO interface. Calculations were performed using the linear-combination of atomic orbitals method implemented in the CRYSTAL code. We used localized Gaussian-type basis sets including polarization orbitals and considered all the electrons for Ti, O, and La. For Sr, we used a Hartree-Fock pseudopotential. For La, we used the Stuttgart energy-consistent pseudopotential. The basis sets of Sr and O were optimized for SrTiO$_3$. The basis sets of La, Gaussian exponents smaller than $0.1$ were disregarded and the remaining outermost polarization exponents for the 10s, 11s shells (0.5672, 0.2488), 9p, 10p shells (0.5279, 0.1967), and 5d, 6d, 7d shells (2.0107, 0.9641, 0.3223), together with Al 4sp (0.1752) exponent from the 8-31G Al basis set, were optimized for LaAlO$_3$. The Brillouin zone integrations were performed using a $12 \times 12 \times 12$ mesh of $k$ points for the five-atom unit cell. For LASTO: $x$ in 20-atom supercells and for STO/LAO/vacuum stacks (all doubled and rotated $90^\circ$ in plane), we used a $4 \times 4 \times 3$ points-grid and a $4 \times 4 \times 4$ points-grid, respectively. The self-consistent-field calculations were converged until the energy changes between interactions were smaller than $10^{-6}$ Hartree. An extra-large predefined pruned grid consisting of 75 radial points and 974 angular points was used for the numerical integration of charge density. Structural optimizations were performed until they reached together thresholds of $3 \times 10^{-5}$ Hartree/Bohr on the root-mean square values of forces and of $1 \times 10^{-4}$ Bohr on the root-mean-square values of atomic displacements. The level of accuracy in evaluating the Coulomb and exchange series is controlled by five parameters: the values used in our calculations are $7, 7, 7, 7$, and $14$.

For pure bulk compounds in the cubic perovskite structure, this approach yields a lattice constant and static dielectric constant for STO ($\varepsilon_{STO} = 3.88\times$, $\varepsilon_{STO} = 265$) and LAO ($\varepsilon_{LAO} = 2.80\times$) in good agreement with experimental data at room temperature ($\varepsilon_{STO} = 290$, $\varepsilon_{LAO} = 24$). When the in-plane lattice constant of LAO is expanded to that of STO to accommodate the epitaxial strain, the $c$-parameter contracts as expected from elastic theory, yielding $c_{STO}/c_{LAO} = 3.75\times$ ($c_{LAO}/c_{STO} = 0.97$) and the dielectric constant becomes anisotropic: $\varepsilon_{LAO} = 23$, $\varepsilon_{STO} = 27$. The static dielectric constant combines a frozen-ion electronic part (that is, the optical dielectric constant $\varepsilon_{opt}$) and a relaxed-ion phonon contribution through the expression

$$
\varepsilon_{LAO}^{rel} = \varepsilon_{LAO}^{opt} + \frac{4\pi}{120} \sum \frac{\omega_{ij}^0}{\omega_{ij}}
$$

**Table 1 | Calculated dielectric constants of SrTiO$_3$ and LaAlO$_3$.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contribution</th>
<th>Mode</th>
<th>$\varepsilon_{STO}$</th>
<th>$\varepsilon_{LAO}$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Electronic</td>
<td>TO$_2$</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phonons</td>
<td>TO$_2$</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TO$_3$</td>
<td>559</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>265</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Electronic and phonon transverse optical mode (TO$_n$) contributions to the static dielectric constant of SrTiO$_3$ and LaAlO$_3$ in the cubic perovskite structure at the optimized lattice constant.*
The oscillator strength of mode $m$ and the difference of energy $P_1$ is equal to 3.84 Å, slightly larger than the value of 3.81 Å for CB bulk LASTO:0.5 in the same strain conditions, consistent with the electrostrictive effect. This value is comparable to what is measured experimentally. Increasing $m$, the first-principles calculations predict that the system becomes metallic for $m$ between 6 and 7, in perfect agreement with the polar catastrophe scenario and the experimental measurements.

For $x = 0.75$, we considered the atomic arrangement of configuration M in Fig. 4, that corresponds to a checkerboard arrangement in plane. Here again the static dielectric constant of the alloy remains essentially equal to that of LAO: $\varepsilon_{\text{LASTO}}^{3.75} = 26$.

### References


38. Towler, M. CRYSTAL resource page, 2011, see www.tcm.phy.cam.ac.uk/~mdt26/crystal.html.


Acknowledgements

Support of this work by the Schweizerischer Nationalfonds zur Förderung der wissenschaftlichen Forschung, in particular the National Center of Competence in Research, Materials with Novel Electronic Properties, MaNEP, and by the European Union through the project OxIDes is gratefully acknowledged. We also thank Dr. Max Döbeli for the RBS measurements and Dr. Pavlo Zubko for assistance in the capacitance measurements. Ph.G. is grateful to the Francqui Foundation.

Author contributions

Project was conceived by P.R.W. Film growth was carried out by M.L.R.-S., C.C., D.L., and C.W.S. The deposition target was synthesized by E.P. X-ray diffraction and RHEED measurements were performed by M.L.R.-S., C.C. and C.W.S. Electrical characterizations were performed by M.L.R.-S., C.C., D.L., M.M., and S.G. Theoretical calculations were carried out by D.F. and Ph.G. All authors contributed to interpretation of the results and writing the manuscript.

Additional information

Competing financial interests: The authors declare no competing financial interests.

Reprints and permission information is available online at http://npg.nature.com/reprintsandpermissions/